

Answer to Scenario 1 – Wind Shift

Boat S is penalized under rule 16.1, Changing Course. Rule 16.1 states, "When a right-of-way boat changes course, she shall give the other boat room to keep clear." S changes course when so close to P that P is unable to keep clear and there is contact. Therefore, S failed to give P room to keep clear, thereby breaking rule 16.1. The fact that S's change of course is in response to a windshift is not relevant to the application of rule 16.1.

P breaks rule 10, On Opposite Tacks, but is exonerated (not penalized) under rule 21, Exoneration, or rule 64.1(a), Decisions: Penalties and Exoneration, because she is compelled to break rule 10 by S's breach of rule 16.1.

S also breaks rule 14, Avoiding Contact; but as the right-of-way boat, she is exonerated (not penalized) for breaking rule 14 as the contact does not cause damage or injury (see rule 14(6)). P does not break rule 14, because S changes course so close to P that it is not possible for P to avoid the contact.

(From Dave Perry's 100 Best Rules Quizzes, Quiz 6. Used with permission.)