Answer to Scenario 4 - Tacking

Boat S is penalized for breaking rule 11, On the Same Tack, Overlapped, which says, "When boats are on the same tack and overlapped, a windward boat shall keep clear of a leeward boat." Once she is past head to wind, rule 13, While Tacking, requires P to keep clear of S until P is on a close-hauled course. When she has borne away to a close-hauled course (the course she will sail when close-hauled), P becomes the right-of-way boat under rule 11 regardless of her point of sail prior to the tack or whether her sails have filled or not after the tack

When P is on a close-hauled course, rule 13 ceases to apply and she becomes the right-of-way boat under rule 11. At that point, rule 15, Acquiring Right of Way, builds in a short period of time during which P (the new right-of-way boat) must give S (the new keep-clear boat) room to keep clear. S makes no effort at all to keep clear and substantial time passes prior to the contact. Therefore S, as the windward boat, is penalized for failing to keep clear of P, the leeward boat.

S also broke rule 14, Avoiding Contact, because it was possible for her to have avoided hitting P. Whether or not P could have avoided contact when it was clear to her that S was not going to keep clear is a moot point. Even if she had broken rule 14, P, as the right-of-way boat, would be exonerated (not penalized) for breaking rule 14 as the contact did not cause damage or injury (see rule 14(b)).

(From Dave Perry's 100 Best Rules Quizzes, Quiz 13. Used with permission.)